ASSESS THE EFFECTIVENESS OF IMPLEMENTATION OF THE EUROPEAN FOUNDATION FOR QUALITY MANAGEMENT (EFQM) IN HOSPITAL

Farhad Adhami Moghadam¹, Mehdi Hosseinzadeh² Mohammad Sahebalzamani³ and MojganTabatabaee Jamarani⁴

1Ophthalmologist, Assistant Professor of Islamic Azad University Tehran Medical Sciences Branch, Tehran, Iran
2Nursing Education, Islamic Azad University, Tehran Medical Sciences branch, Tehran, Iran
3Educational Management, Assistant Professor of Islamic Azad University Tehran Medical Sciences Branch, Tehran, Iran
4Nursing Education, Islamic Azad University, Tehran Medical Sciences branch, Tehran, Iran
*corresponding author: Farhad Adhami Moghadam,

ABSTRACT
Introduction: today, the role of assessment and monitor systems in improving the Foundation for Quality Management is well known. Evaluate the performance of organizations to identify strengths and a weakness in order to make optimal use of the resources have a particular position and has received so much attention. This descriptive study was done in 2012. The target population composed of entire staff employed in center of training - therapy of Poursina of Rasht city. Sampling method was census and data collection tools were questionnaire of assess the performance of the Foundation for Quality Management Model which includes50 items and composed of 9 parts. To measure content validity of the questionnaire and its reliability, Cronbach's alpha was used. Average rating the performance of the center, in aspect of leadership 60.41 of the total 100 points, in aspect of policy and strategy, 51.74 of the total 80 points, in aspect of staff 49.55 of 100 points, in aspect of partnerships and resources 57.08 of 100 points, in aspect of processes, 69.93 of 120 points, in aspect of customer results 114.98 of 200 points, in aspect of personnel benefits 52.36 100 points, in aspect of community results 36.83 of 60 points, and in aspect of key performance 80.48 of the total 140 was rated. Average rating of the center as a whole 573.4 of 1000 points. (57.34% of 100). According to the results and investigation and identification of strengths and weaknesses showed that the quality of management of hospitals is at the average level and further attention particularly to employees ‘measurement and employee outcomes is essential.

KEYWORDS: Assess the effectiveness, Hospital, European Foundation for Quality Management (EFQM) model.

INTRODUCTION
Organizations in the broadest sense are the basic foundations of today’s society and management, the most important factor in survival, growth or death of organizations. In the turbulent and changing world of the era, organizations tend quickly from simplification to difficulty and then have to adjust the pattern of their performance (Robbins and Setro, 2007). Propound of topics and issues such as administrative system reform, changes in organizational structure, collaborative management, downsizing, decentralization, increasing productivity, improving methods, improving quality and etc. in our country suggest that organizations are in trouble. (Lameei, 2007). Achieve goals and improve the performance of government agencies require appropriate way to assess performance. Because achieving the goals of public agencies without a comprehensive model to measure and review programs is not possible and organizations cannot without regard to the facts and the results of their activities apply their effective manage on practices programs. Obviously, using such a model could direct the operation of government agencies and provide scientific and insights perspectives, and eventually prevent scattered, judgment, and applying personal opinion (Alvani, 2010).

Leaders of Iranian organizations have also introduced a decade ago with the models and have adopted them as a framework for the management of their organization. Choose the right approach and mainstreaming and integrating them with each other and trying to establish a management based on the processes is including activities that is applicable in the management framework and when associated with self-assessment clear the strengths and improvable areas of organization based on it improvement programs are defined and with performance improvement program effectiveness of approaches has improved and achieving the goals of the organization makes possible. While a myriad managing tools and techniques are employed in organizations, EFQM Model’s gives a comprehensive view of the organization to see how these methods work well together and complement each other (Najmi, 2010. Due to the implementation of the European Foundation for Quality Management in training – medical center of Poursina of Rash
city from 2006, researcher decided to do a study to evaluate the effectiveness of the implementation of European Foundation for Quality Management in hospital of Poursina of Rasht city and evaluate this center on the 9 aspects of leadership, policy and strategy, staff, partnerships and resources, processes, customer, employee results, society results and key results of performance and on the basis of the results determine strengths and weaknesses and improvable areas.

MATERIALS AND METHODS
This descriptive study was performed sectional in 2012. Entire staff of training - Medical Center of Poursina of Rasht city formed population. Sampling method is census and data collection tools was performance evaluation questionnaire based on the Excellence Model EFQM and after introducing the model and its applications, it was completed by the research population. The questionnaire consists of 50 items and formulated in 9 sections and the current position of the organization in form of the 50 items evaluated and its 5 standards belonged to encouragement and 4 other criteria relevant to the results. Indicators of empowerment including leadership consists of 5 items, policy and strategy includes four items, the staff consists of 5 items, 5 items about partnerships and resources, processes consists of 6 items and indicators relevant to results of the customer include 10 items, the results of the staff consists of 5 items and result of the population consists of 3 items and key results of performance contains 7 items.

For scoring questions, 5-point Likert scale was used to answer (Too high score: 5 and too low score 1). To determine the validity of questionnaire, content validity was used so that after reading books and articles, the questionnaire provided and owned fifteen professors and faculty members of Islamic Azad University of Tehran Medical Branch and University of Medical Sciences of Guilan and after collecting and enforcing supervision of professors, the final questionnaire was prepared. To assess stability of the questionnaire of this research, the retes test was used on a sample of 50 members of staff, with an interval of 10 days, and correlation coefficient between two implementations 0.84 were conducted that indicates good stability of the instrument. Well as internal consistency of the questionnaire by Cronbach's alpha 0.88 was obtained. Collected information was analyzed through questionnaires using descriptive and inferential statistics by software SPSS 16 and to analyze the data, one - sample t -test, Friedman test and Chi Square were used.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS
In this research, the effectiveness of the implementation of organizational excellence system of Poursina of Rasht city was evaluated and the findings based on tests of one - sample t -test And Friedman test and Chi Square were analyzed. 74.7% of samples were women and 25.3% of them consisted male. Minimum age of people was 18 and the oldest of them was 52 years old. Least work experience of the people was 6 months and the oldest person was 29 years of experience. Minimum management experience in the people with history of management was one years with (n = 61) and the oldest person in the field of management has 20 years of experience.

In relation to the assessment of leadership based on adaptation of organizational excellence model, respondents believed the average impact and role for this area, and not shown a significant difference with the mean value (p > 0.05). In relation to the evaluation of policy state among criteria empowerments, the difference was significant (p<0.05). That is, the respondents of these questions give an impact and role higher than average for questions about the criteria that is a sign of the strength of the hospital. In relation to evaluate of employees’ status, the difference was significant, and the impact and role lower than average for this area was considered. In regard to the scope of partnerships and resources, both the impact and role was also considered less than average for this area. Means significantly different from the mean value was found. In relation to assessment of the process status, the staff believed a role and effects lower than average for this area, too (p <0.05). That is, the difference with the mean value was significant.

In connection with the evaluation of patient outcomes (p<0.05) was also seen significant different with the mean value and the employees participating in the plan believed to the impact and role lower than average for this area. In the field of human resource results, based on compatibility with the European Foundation for Quality Management model, the results indicate a role and impact lower than average for this area, which is a part of the hospital's weaknesses. In relation to the evaluation of the community results, at the 2.3 functional levels, the effect higher than average was seen.
(p<0.05) and at 1.3, the effect about the average was observed that show in this area Performance was slightly higher than average.

In relation to the last field of the results criteria, namely the evaluation of key results status of performance based on the compatibility with EFQM model results also reflects a score lower than average on most functional levels and indicates that this is a hospital weakness. There is a significance statistical relationship between gender and empowerments criteria (p= 0.0001), but relationship between gender and results criteria (p = 0.898) and general criteria (p = 0.85) is not significant.

Information obtained from questionnaires to evaluate the effectiveness of the implementation of the European Foundation for Quality Management systems in hospital Poursina of Rasht city were analyzed and the results are as follows:
- Leadership: 60.41 (6%) points from a total of 100 (10%) points.
- Policy and Strategy 51.74 (1.5%) points from a total of 80 (8%) points.
- Staff 49.55 (1.5%) points from a total of 100 (10%) points.
- Partnerships and Resources 57.08 (7.5%) points from a total of 100 (10%) points.
- Processes 69.93 (9.6%) points from a total of 120 (12%) points.
- Results of patients 114.98 (49.11%) points from a total of 200 (20%) points.
- Results of Employees of 52.36 (2.5%) points from a total of 100 (10%) points.
- The results of 83.36 (3.6%) points from 60 (6%) points.
- Key results of 80.48 (8%) points from a total of 140 (14%) points.

In response to the overall objective of evaluating the effectiveness of implementation the European Foundation for Quality Management (EFQM) in Poursina hospital of Rasht city, the mean score for the whole, 573.4 (57.34%) points from a total of 1000 (100%) points was calculated. (Table 1)

Table 1. evaluation of the status of scores for different categories and distance to the optimal point based on scoring 500 points for each of the measures of employee’s Poursina Hospital of Rasht city.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scope</th>
<th>Average score</th>
<th>Percentage of average</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Total Score</th>
<th>Distance to optimum</th>
<th>Distance to the optimum (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Leadership (5 items)</td>
<td>60.41</td>
<td>6 %</td>
<td>12.66</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>39.59</td>
<td>39.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy (4 items)</td>
<td>51.74</td>
<td>5.1%</td>
<td>11.59</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>28.26</td>
<td>35.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employees (5 items)</td>
<td>49.55</td>
<td>9.4%</td>
<td>15.53</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>50.45</td>
<td>50.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partnerships and Resources (5 items)</td>
<td>57.08</td>
<td>5.7%</td>
<td>12.78</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>42.92</td>
<td>42.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Processes (6 items)</td>
<td>69.93</td>
<td>9.6%</td>
<td>15.29</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>50.07</td>
<td>41.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empowerment measure</td>
<td>288.73</td>
<td>28.87%</td>
<td>53.83</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>211.27</td>
<td>42.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patients Results (10 items)</td>
<td>114.98</td>
<td>11.49%</td>
<td>23.19</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>85.02</td>
<td>42.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employee’s Results (5 Q)</td>
<td>52.36</td>
<td>5.2%</td>
<td>13.3</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>47.64</td>
<td>47.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The results of community(3 items)</td>
<td>36.83</td>
<td>6.3%</td>
<td>9.91</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>23.17</td>
<td>38.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key results of performance (7 items)</td>
<td>80.48</td>
<td>8 %</td>
<td>16.86</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>59.52</td>
<td>42.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Results of Benchmark</td>
<td>284.66</td>
<td>28.46%</td>
<td>52.97</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>215.34</td>
<td>43.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall measure of effectiveness</td>
<td>573.4</td>
<td>57.34%</td>
<td>101.52</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>426.6</td>
<td>42.66</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 1. Review the different domains and comparison with the ideal points based on scoring 500 points to measure empowerment among workers Poursina Hospital

Figure 2. Review the different domains and comparison with the advantage of a favorable situation by scoring 500 points for the outcome measure of hospital workers Poursina
CONCLUSIONS
Kelly (2008) argues that the administration method of health institutions in the past, were in terms of hierarchy and bureaucracy, of course, this traditional method is effective for relatively static environments. Achieve goals and improve the performance of government agencies require appropriate way to assess performance. Because achieving the goals of government agencies without a comprehensive model for assessing and reviewing programs is not applicable and organizations can not without considering the facts and the results of activities, apply their effective management on implementation of programs. Obviously, representation and utilizing such a model can direct performance of government agencies and give a clear and scientific perspectives and horizons, and eventually prevents scattering, judgment and acts personal opinion and taste (Alvani, 2011). The European Foundation for Quality Management models have been developed based on the concepts and philosophy of management quality and aim to achieve total quality and the philosophy can be used for all of organizations regardless of the types of activities, size, structure or organizational maturity in order to obtain success in achieving its ideals and strategic objectives and requires to establish appropriate management system, European Foundation for Quality Management Model is an executive tools to help organizations by make the realization of this issue by measurement of rate of exposure of sustainable excellence route and to help them to identify gaps and determine solutions with more motivation. While many of the tools and techniques of management in the organization are employed.

EFQM Model gives a comprehensive view of the organization to see how these methods work well together and complement each other (Wurtz, 2008). These models are a tool to help organizations to measure rate of exposure in route of organizational excellence and balanced growth. This model help organizations with comprising its status quo determine difference then based on the difference and assessment of its causes and type specify solutions of optimization of current situation and implement them (Ehrlich, 2009). Organizational excellence models with emulating the successful businesses in the world have been able to provide a suitable framework for managing organizations in the competitive environment. Clear feature of these models with is the type of attitude of the organization (holistic) that allows to management while evaluate the organization under his command, to compare it with other similar organizations. On the other hand, models are usually having designed so that allows organization to use different techniques (Mralles, 2008). This model is a set of methods and tools to evaluate the organization and a model to move to EFQM model. European Foundation for Quality Management in the general sense has been defined as growth, and improving an organization in all aspects, obtain satisfaction of all stakeholders, creating a dialogue between the demands and expectations of all stakeholders, ensuring long-term success of the organization (Carlos Bou Llusar et al., 2008). Based on data analysis and the advantage gained from 9 main criteria of performance appraisal process of the organization has been concluded that the quality of management of hospitals surveyed is the average level and whole in all areas need to be improved. Addressing weaknesses and try to overcome them and also strengthen the improvement could be made to improve the quality of the hospitals. For quality improvement, it is necessary to the hospital to investigate the status, the performance of hospital management and amount far or near from ideal conditions of excellence be determined then, with aware of their strengths and weaknesses, plan to take the necessary steps in the growth and excellence.

From the perspective of enabling factors, benchmark policy has achieved the highest score that is an indicator of the strength point of the hospital in this section. The lowest rating allocated to benchmarking employee that is a weaknesses of the hospital. In the aspect of results, results of community is one of the strengths and results of employees is considered as a weaknesses for the hospital, in total, quality of management in hospital Poursina, with regard to gaining 573.4 from a total of 1000 points, is in the average level. Worth noting that whilst the employees are satisfied and motivated, the most critical element for success is in the hands of administrators and vice versa, if the employees keep out motivation and job satisfaction and commitment to work, doing the affairs of the hospital will face many problems, i.e. it may not provide good services to clients, they will not innovate and do not make an attempt to reduce errors in perform tasks and deliver the services. Tari (2006) also believed that personnel’s job security in workplace and human relations of management and personnel, material and spiritual encouragement, will create essential motivation to implement the principles of total quality management in staff.

In general, dealing with weaknesses and strengthen and trying to overcome them and strengthening improvement points in the hospital studied, indicating the fact that for optimal management should planning be more for and by this way,
should be improve the quality of service. Akhshik in her study also noted that addressing weaknesses and try to overcome them and strengthen the improvement points are the quality of risk factors (Farajpahlou and Akhshik, 2009). The findings of Eqbal (2007) also reflect the fact that performance evaluation is a systematic and comprehensive process in which the activities, processes and results are compared with established organizational objectives and criteria and on the basis of the results can be act to improve the situation of the organization on the basis of an excellence model such as EFQM. Assessment process allows the organization to clearly identify strengths and areas for improvement and develop a plan to improve different aspects (Khalilnejad, 2010).

Health care services, in terms of type of services and dealing with human’ life is attended particularly by its relevant managers and stakeholders. Thus, expectations of the people from hospitals as the most important Health Care centers are increasing. These problems have been faced managers by challenges of these organizations, so they should be excogitate to make adjustments and partial solving of these problems. The directors and officers of health, it is expected that use the latest knowledge of management and methods and practices that leads to optimal and effective use of health care facilities to further enhance efficiency and effectiveness of services. Optimal administration of hospitals as the most important health care centers providers always have been considered by policymakers and scholars of health sector. Due to the limited number investments and its long payback in the health sector as well as factors such as the high cost of hospital construction and high cost of equipment and devices and shortage of skilled and specialized manpower, expansion of hospital facilities is very difficult. So make maximum use of existing facilities using superior quality management techniques are needed (Asefzadeh, 2011). Researchers hope the findings of this study and similar research conducted in other centers, the quantitative and qualitative improvement of health for all systems is provided.

REFERENCES